



Between Suns: Twilight in Rabbinic Sources

Dr. Sarit Kattan Gribetz

Sarit Kattan Gribetz is a JTS faculty fellow and an associate professor of classical Judaism in the Theology Department at Fordham University as well as the co-director of Fordham's Center for Jewish Studies. She received her BA and PhD from the Department of Religion at Princeton University. Her first book, *Time and Difference in Rabbinic Judaism* (2020), received the National Jewish Book Award in Scholarship. She is currently researching the gendered history of Jerusalem, and is studying in the kollel at Yeshivat Maharat.

Part I: Terminology

1. Proverbs 7:9

בְּנֶשֶׁף-בְּעֶרְבַיּוֹם;
בְּאִישׁוֹן לַיְלָה, וְאֶפְלָה

in the twilight, in the evening,
at the time of night and darkness.

2. Exodus 12:6

וְהִיָּה לָכֶם לְמִשְׁמֶרֶת, עַד אֶרְבַּעַת עָשָׂר יוֹם לַחֹדֶשׁ הַזֶּה; וְשָׁחֲטוּ אֹתוֹ, כָּל קְהַל עֲדַת-יִשְׂרָאֵל--בֵּין הָעֶרְבָיִם

You shall keep it until the fourteenth day of this month; then the whole assembled congregation of Israel shall slaughter it at twilight.

Part II: Doubt

3. Moshe Halbertal, *The Birth of Doubt: Confronting Uncertainty in Early Rabbinic Literature* (Brown Judaica Series, 2020), 174

The nature of the uncertainty presented by *bein ha-shemashot* can be understood in three different ways. The first is that the intermediate time between light and darkness is a sort of mixture of night and day, containing something of both. The existence of this intermediate time reflects the view that the transition from day to night is not abrupt. According to this view, the problem with the categories “day” and “night” when applied to the gradual transition to darkness is that they are not mutually exclusive. The twenty-four-hour cycle cannot be divided into times that are “day” and times that are “night,” because there are transitional times that are both day and night.

According to the second understanding, *bein ha-shemashot* is either entirely day or entirely night, but we are unable to definitively place it on either side of the temporal barrier. Day and night are mutually exclusive, but they are not defined and delineated clearly enough to enable us to assign these transitional times to one of them.

According to the third understanding, during *bein ha-shemashot* there is a single distinct moment of transition from day to night, but the moment is elusive, and we are incapable of defining it. Accordingly, day transitions to night at some moment between sunset and darkness, but our inability to identify this moment places the entire temporal unit in a state of uncertainty. The third understanding does not undermine the fundamental binarity of day and night, but it does question our ability to ascertain the moment where one transitions to the other. All we can do is demarcate a broader temporal unit within which this momentary transitional event takes place.

4. Varro, *de Lingua Latina* 6.5 (trans. Loeb)

Secundum hoc dicitur crepusculum a crepero: id vocabulum sumpserunt a Sabinis, unde veniunt Crepusci nominati Amiterno, qui eo tempore erant nati, ut Luci<i> prima luce in Reatino; crepusculum significat dubium; ab eo res dictae dubiae creperae, quod crepusculum dies etiam nunc sit an iam nox multis dubium.

In line with this, *crepusculum* 'dusk' is said from *creperum* 'obscure'; this word they took from the Sabines, from whom come those who were named *Crepusci*, from Amiternum, who had been born at that time of day, just like the Lucii, who were those born at dawn (*prima luce*) in the Reatine country. *Crepusculum* means doubtful: from this doubtful matters are called *creperae* 'obscure,' because dusk is a time when to many it is doubtful whether it is even yet day or is already night.

5. Mishnah Shabbat 19:5 (trans. Oxford Annotated Mishnah)

קטן נמול לשמנה, לתשעה, ולעשרה, ולאחד עשר, ולשנים עשר, לא פחות ולא יותר. הא כיצד. פדרפו, לשמנה. נולד בין השמשות, נמול לתשעה. בין השמשות לערב שבת, נמול לעשרה. יום טוב לאחר השבת, נמול לאחד עשר. שני ימים טובים של ראש השנה, נמול לשנים עשר. קטן החולה, אין מוהלין אותו עד שיבריא

A child is circumcised on the eighth, ninth, tenth, eleventh, or twelfth [day]: no less, no more. How is this? [If born] in its regular way - on the eighth. If born at twilight, he is circumcised on the ninth. If at twilight on the eve of the Sabbath, he is circumcised on the tenth. If a festival day falls after the Sabbath, he is circumcised on the eleventh. If the two Festival days of the New Year [fall on Sunday and Monday], he is circumcised on the twelfth. If a child is sick, one may not circumcise him until he becomes healthy.

6. Mishnah Shabbat 19:3 (trans. Oxford Annotated Mishnah)

מרחיצין את הקטן, בין לפני המילה ובין לאחר המילה, ומזלפין עליו ביד, אכל לא בכלי. רבי אלעזר בן עזריה אומר, מרחיצין את הקטן ביום השלישי שחל להיות בשבת, שצנאמר (בראשית לד) ויהי ביום השלישי בהיותם פאבים. ספק ונאנדרוגינוס אין מחללין עליו את השבת, ורבי יהודה מתיר באנדרוגינוס

One may wash the child, whether before or after the circumcision, and sprinkle him by hand, but not by a utensil. R. Eleazar ben Azariah says: One may wash the child on the third day if it falls on a Sabbath. As it is said: *And it came to pass on the third day when they were in pain* [Genesis 43:25]. [If there is a child about whom there is] doubt, or an *androgynos*, one may not profane the Sabbath on its account. But Rabbi Judah permits [circumcision on the Sabbath] for the *androgynos*.

7. Mishnah Niddah 6:14 (trans. Oxford Annotated Mishnah)

הרואה יום אחד עשר בין השמשות, תחלת נדה וסוף נדה, תחלת זיקה וסוף זיקה, יום ארבעים לזכר ויום שמונים לנקבה, בין השמשות לכלן, הרי אלו טועות. אמר רבי יהושע, עד שאתם מתקנים את השוטות, תקנו את הפקחות

If she sees [blood] on the eleventh day of her cycle at twilight, or at the beginning or end of her period of menstruation, at the beginning or end of her days of irregular discharge, on the fortieth day after the birth of a baby boy, or on the eightieth day after the birth of a baby girl - all at twilight - then all of these are mistaken [in their counting]. Said Rabbi Joshua: Before you arrange [things] for women who are not legally competent, you should arrange [things] for women who are of sound mind.

8. Mishnah Keritot 4:2 (trans. Oxford Annotated Mishnah)

שבת יום הכפורים ועשה מלאכה בין השמשות ואין ידוע באיזה מהם עשה. רבי אליעזר מחיב חטאת, ורבי יהושע פוטר. אמר רבי יוסי, לא נחלקו על העושה מלאכה בין השמשות, שהיא פטור, שאני אומר, מקצת מלאכה עשה מהיום, ומקצתה למחר. ועל מה נחלקו, על העושה בתוך היום ואין ידוע אם בשבת עשה ואם ביום הכפורים עשה. או על העושה ואין ידוע

מֵעֵין אִיזוּ מְלֹאכָה עָשָׂה. רַבִּי אֱלִיעֶזֶר מְחַיֵּב חֲטָאת, וְרַבִּי יְהוֹשֻׁעַ פּוֹטֵר. אָמַר רַבִּי יְהוּדָה, פּוֹטְרוֹ הִנֵּה רַבִּי יְהוֹשֻׁעַ אִף מֵאֲשָׁם תְּלוּי

It was a Sabbath or the Day of Atonement: if he performed an act of labor at twilight but it is not known in which one of them he performed it - Rabbi Eliezer deems him liable to a purgation offering, and Rabbi Joshua deems him exempt. Rabbi Yose said: They did not disagree about one performing an act of labor at twilight, that he is exempt, for I say: He may have performed part of the labor on one day, and part on the next. About what did they disagree? About one who performs it while it is day, but it is not known whether he performed it on the Sabbath or performed it on the Day of Atonement; or about one who performs it but it is not known what type of labor he performed - Rabbi Eliezer deems him liable to a purgation offering, and Rabbi Joshua deems him exempt. Rabbi Judah said: Rabbi Joshua would exempt him even from the offering for uncertain guilt.

9. Mishnah Demai 1:4 (trans. *Oxford Annotated Mishnah*)

הַדְּמַאי, מְעַרְבִין בוֹ, וּמְשַׁתְּתֵפִין בוֹ, וּמְבָרְכִין עָלָיו, וּמְזַמְּנִין עָלָיו, וּמְפָרְשִׁין אוֹתוֹ עָרוֹם, בֵּין הַשְּׂמֻשׁוֹת
Demai: one may make an *eruv* with it, and one may make a partnership with it, and one may recite the blessing over it, and one may invite others [to recite the communal blessing after meals] over it, and one may separate [tithes from] it naked, during twilight [on the eve of the Sabbath].

10. Mishnah Shabbat 2:7 (trans. *Oxford Annotated Mishnah*)

שְׁלֹשָׁה דְּבָרִים צָרִיךְ אָדָם לומר בְּתוֹךְ בֵּיתוֹ עֶרֶב שַׁבָּת עִם הַשְּׂכָה. עֲשֶׂה רְתָם. עֲרַבְתָּם. הַדְּלִיקוּ אֶת הַנֵּר. סִפְּק הַשְּׂכָה סִפְּקוֹ אֵין
הַשְּׂכָה, אֵין מְעַשְׂרִין אֶת הַדְּמַאי, וְאֵין מְטַבִּילִין אֶת הַכֶּלִים, וְאֵין מְדַלִּיקִין אֶת הַנְּרוֹת, אֲבָל מְעַשְׂרִין אֶת הַדְּמַאי, וּמְעַרְבִין, וְטוֹמְנִין אֶת הַחֲמִין

Three things must a person say within his house at nightfall on the eve of Sabbath: “Have you tithed? Have you prepared the *eruv*? Light the lamp!” **If there is doubt whether night has or has not fallen**: one may not tithe produce that is known to be untithed, or immerse utensils, or light the lamps; but one may tithe produce of uncertain status, and prepare the *eruv*, and store hot food.

Part II: Divinity

11. Mishnah Avot 5:6

עֲשָׂרָה דְּבָרִים נִבְרָאוּ בֵּין הַשְּׂמֻשׁוֹת, פִּי הָאָרֶץ, וּפִי הַבְּאֵר, וּפִי הָאֵתוֹן, וְהַקֶּשֶׁת, וְהַמָּן, וְהַמָּטָה, וְהַשְּׁמִיר, וְהַכֶּתֵב, וְהַמְּכַתֵּב, וְהַלְּחוֹת. וַיֵּשׂ אוֹמְרִים, אִף הַמְּזִיקִין, וּקְבוּרַתוֹ שֶׁל מֹשֶׁה, וְאֵילוֹ שֶׁל אַבְרָהָם אַבְיָנוּ. וַיֵּשׂ אוֹמְרִים, אִף צֶבֶת בְּצֶבֶת עֲשׂוּיָה
Ten are the things created on Sabbath eve **at twilight**. And here they are: the mouth of the earth; and the mouth of the well; and the mouth of the donkey; and the rainbow; and the manna; and the staff; and the worm [*shamir*]; and the script; and the text; and the tablets. And some add: Also the demons. And the grave of Moses. And the ram of Father Abraham. And some add: And the tongs made with tongs.

12. Mekhilta de Rabbi Ishmael Vayasa 5 on Exodus 16:16 (ed. and trans. Lauterbach)

כך לא הניחו אהרן אלא בשנה השנייה. וזה אחד מעשרה דברים שנבראו בערב שבת בין השמשות ואילו הן הקשת והמן והמטה והכתב והשמיר והלוחות ופתיחת פי הארץ שבלעה את הרשעים ופי האתון של בלעם הרשע וקבורתו של משה ומערה שעמד בה משה ואליהו ויש אומרים אף בגדיו של אדם הראשון ומקלו של אהרן שקדיו ופרחיו. שבעה דברים מכוסין מבני אדם ואלו הן יום המיתה ויום הנחמה ועומק הדין ואין אדם יודע במה משתכר ואין אדם יודע מה בלבו של חבירו ומלכות בית דוד מתי תחזור למקומה ומלכות חייבת זו מתי תעקר.

And this [the ark] was one of the ten things that were created on the eve of the Sabbath **at twilight**: the rainbow; the manna; the rod; the writing; the *shamir*; the tables of stone; the opening of the mouth of the earth that swallowed the wicked; the mouth of the donkey of Balaam the wicked; the sepulchre of Moses; and the cave in which Moses and later Elijah stood. And some say: Also the garments of the first man and the rod of Aaron with its ripe almonds and blossoms. There are seven things hidden from men, and they are these: The day of death; the day of comfort; the depth of judgment. No man knows by what he can make a profit. No man knows what is in the heart of his fellow man. No one knows when the Kingdom of David will be restored to its former position, nor when this wicked kingdom will be uprooted.

13. Sifrei Deuteronomy Vezot Haberakha 355 (ed. and trans. Sefaria)

כי שם חלקת מחוקק ספון - זה קבר של משה, שנתונה בחלקת גד, והוא לא מת אלא בחלקו של ראובן, שנ' עלה אל הר העברים הזה הר נבו! ומה ת"ל כי שם חלקת מחוקק ספון? מלמד שהיה משה מוטל מת בגפי שכינה ד' מילין, מחלקו של ראובן לחלקו של גד, ומלאכי השרת מספידין אותו ואומרים: יבוא שלום, וינוח על משכבו. וזה אחד מן הדברים שנבראו בערב שבת **בין השמשות**, ואלו הם: הקשת, והמן והבאר, והכתב והמכתב והלוחות, ופי האתון וקברו של משה, ומערה שעמ' בה משה ואליהו, ומקלו של אהרן שקדיה ופרחיה; וי"א אף בגדו של אדם הראשון, וי"א הכתונות ומזיקים; ר' יאשיה אמר משום אביו אף האיל, והשמיר; ר' נחמיה אומר אף האור, והפרדה; רבי יהודה אומר אף הצבת; וכן הוא אומר צבתא בצבתא תתעבד; קמייתא מאי הוית? לא ברייה הות? אמרו לו: והרי יכול לעשותה בדפוס, ולהתיכה בתוכו! - הא לא ברייה הות:

“For there the (burial) plot of the lawgiver is hidden”: This refers to the burial plot of Moses, which is found in the territory of Gad. Moses died in the territory of Reuven, viz. (Devarim 32:49) “Go up, (Moses,) to this Mount Avarim, Mount Nevo.” What, then, is the intent of “For there (in the territory of Gad) the (burial) plot of the lawgiver is hidden”? We are hereby taught that Moses was lying dead in the wings of the Shechinah four *mils* between the territory of Reuven and the territory of Gad, and the ministering angels were eulogizing him saying “Let him come in first and rest in his plot.” And this (the plot) is one of the things that was created on Sabbath eve **at twilight**: the rainbow, the manna, the well (of Miriam), the writ (in the Torah) and the writing (on the tablets), the tablets, the mouth of the ass (of Bilam), the burial plot of Moses, the cave in which Moses and Elijah stood, the staff of Aaron, its

almonds and flowers. Some say, also the vestments of Adam, and some, also the demons. R. Yashia says in the name of his father, also the ram (of Abraham) and the *shamir* (a rare worm). R. Nechemiah says, also the flame and the mule. R. Yehudah says, also the tongs. If you need tongs to make tongs, then who made the first pair? You must say that it was an independent creation (by G-d). This was countered: No, it can be set in a mold and fashioned (at once) within it — so that it is not an independent creation!



Iron Fire-Tongs (Etruscan, 4th-3rd c. BCE, Metropolitan Museum of Art, [here](#))

14. Rafe Neis, *When a Human Gives Birth to a Raven: Rabbis and the Reproduction of Species* (University of California Press, 2023), 138

The larger list itself gathers together a variety of entities that we might lump together under the banner of singularity: the rainbow (that appears to Noah after the flood), manna, Miriam's well, writing, the tablets of the Ten Commandments, tongs, the mouth of Bala'am's talking donkey, the ram to be sacrificed in Isaac's stead, demons (*mazikin*), and the *shamir* (creature)... Like kilayim most of these things created are sui generis, one of a kind, and not reproduced, but are directly brought into being by God. In some ways like fire, some of these are not what we would think of as organic 'biological' entities – for example, the two tablets, writing, and tongs – but instead seem to backdate the origination of what we might call 'technologies' or of what we might think of as human 'inventions' (or 'discoveries') with God's originary creation. In fact, these logics entwine the creation of certain bio-techno-cultural entities with creation, albeit in a somewhat liminal timescape. That these are created during twilight (*bein hashbemasbot*), which is both outside the six days of creation but nonetheless not quite the Sabbath, is an ingenious way of resolving the temporal paradox of certain entities being both outside the scheme of creation yet somehow still calculated and counted (*hashuvim*) within it. And despite their ambiguous alterity to and simultaneous affiliation with the official period of creation's vaunted six days, the mule/hybrid and fire (and other things) make it by a hair's breadth into the divinely wrought universe... the tannaitic sources put an end to the possibility that God did *not* create these himself.

15. Pirque de Rabbi Eliezer 20 (ed. and trans. Sefaria)

בין השמשות של שבת היה אדם ויושב ומהרהר בלבו ואומר אוי לי שמא יבא הנחש שהטעה אותי בערב שבת וישופני עקב נשתלח לו עמוד של אש להאיר לו ולשמרו מכל רע. ראה אדם לעמוד של אש ושמה בלבו ואמר עכשיו אני יודע שהמקום

עמי ופשט ידיו לאור האש וברך מאורי האש. וכשהרחיק ידיו מהאש אמר אדם עכשיו אני יודע שנבדל יום הק' מיום החול שאין לבער אש בשבת אמר ברוך המבדיל בין קודש לחול

At twilight on Saturday (evening), Adam was meditating in his heart and saying: Perhaps the serpent, which deceived me, will come in the evening, and he will bruise me in the heel. A pillar of fire was sent to him to give illumination about him and to guard him from all evil. Adam saw the pillar of fire and rejoiced in his heart, and he put forth his hands to the light of the fire, and said: Blessed art Thou, O Lord our God, King of the universe, who creates the flames of fire. And when he removed his hands from the light of the fire, he said: Now I know that the holy day has been separated from the work day here below (on earth), for fire may not be kindled on the Sabbath day; and in that hour he said: Blessed art Thou, O Lord our God, King of the universe, who divides the holy from the profane.

Part III: Definition and Duration

16. Genesis Rabbah 1:85 (ed. Theodor-Albeck, vol. 1, pg. 85; trans. Kaye)

רבי שאליה לרבי ישמעאל ב"ר יוסי א"ל שמעת מאביך, מהו ויכל אלהים ביום השביעי, אתמהא, אלא כזה שהוא מכה בקורנוס על גבי הסדן, הגביהה מבעוד יום והורידה משתחשך, אר"ש בן יוחאי בשר ודם שאינו יודע לא עתיו ולא רגעיו ולא שעותיו, הוא מוסיף מחול על הקודש, אבל הקב"ה שהוא יודע רגעיו ושעותיו, נכנס בו כחוט השערה.

Rabbi asked Rabbi Ishmael son of Rabbi Yose, "Tell [me] a tradition from your father. What is the meaning of 'God finished on the seventh day [all of His work that He did and rested on the seventh day from all the work He had done]' (Gen 2:2)?" He said to him, "It is like this: He strikes with a hammer [or mallet] on the anvil. He raises it while it is still day, and brings it down once it becomes dark." Rabbi Shimon bar Yokhai said, "Flesh and blood, who knows not his *rega'im*, *'ittim*, and *sha'ot*, [must] add from the ordinary to the holy, but the Holy One, Blessed is He, who knows His *rega'im*, *'ittim*, and *sha'ot*, enters [the Sabbath] as a strand of hair."



Funerary stele of a blacksmith (1st c. CE, Museo Archeologico Nazionale di Aquileia, Italy, [here](#))



Marble relief of a chisel and mallet (Roman, 2nd c. CE, Metropolitan Museum of Art, [here](#))

17. Yerushalmi Demai 1:4, 5b

מבין השמשות הדא דתנינו ספק תשיכה ספק אינה תשיכה.

Around twilight, that is what we have stated: “If it is doubtful whether it is night or not.”

18. Yerushalmi Berakhot 1:1, 2b-c (ed. Sefaria; trans. Tzvee Zahavy); see also Genesis Rabbah 6:8

רבי יעקב דרומאה בשם רבי יהודה בן פזי פוכב אחד ודאי יום. שנים לילה. ולית ליה ספק. אית ליה ספק בין פוכב לכוכב. תני כל זמן שפני מזרח מאדימות זהו יום. הכסופו זהו בין השמשות. השחירו נעשה העליון שנה לתתון זהו לילה. רבי אומר הלכנה בתקופתה התחיל גלגל חמה לשקע ותחלת גלגל לכנה לעלות זהו בין השמשות. אומר רבי חנינא סוף גלגל חמה לשקע ותחלת גלגל לכנה לעלות. ותני שמואל בר חייא בר יהודה בשם רבי חנינא התחיל גלגל חמה לשקע אדם עומד בראש הר הפרמל ויורד וטובל בים הגדול ועולה ואוכל בתרומתו חזקה ביום טבל. הדא דתימר בההוא דאזיל ליה בקפונדרא. ברם ההוא דאזיל ליה באי סרטא לא בדא. איזהוא בין השמשות. אומר רבי תנחומא לטיפה של דם שהיא נתונה על גבי חודה של סיף נחלקה לטפחה לכאן ולכאן זהו בין השמשות. איזהוא בין השמשות. משתשקע החמה כדי שיהיה אדם חצי מיל דברי רבי נחמיה. רבי יוסי אומר בין השמשות כהרף עין ולא יכלו לעמוד עליו חכמים

R. Jacob of the south in the name of R. Judah b. Pazzi, “[If one sees] a single star it is certainly still day. [If one sees] two [stars] it is night.” And does he not allow for a case in which there is doubt? He allows for doubt in discerning one star from another. It was taught: As long as the eastern horizon is red, it is [still deemed to be] day. Once [the horizon] darkens, then [we deem it to be] twilight. Once [the horizon] blackens, so that the skies above and [near the earth] below are equally [dark], then [we deem it to be] night. Rabbi says, “When the moon is full, [the period of time between when] the orb of the sun begins to set and the orb of the moon begins to rise is twilight.” Said R. Hanina, “[The period of time between when] the orb of the sun sets fully, and the orb of the moon begins to rise [is twilight].” Samuel taught thus, “The moon does not shine at the time that the sun sets [i.e. it rises later]. And [the moon] does not set at the time that the sun shines [in the morning. It sets earlier].” R. Samuel bar R. Hiyya bar Judah in the name of R. Hanina, “[Consider a case where] the orb of the sun begins to set. A man [who is an unclean priest] standing on top of Mount Carmel [sets out to] run down to

immerse in the Mediterranean [to purify himself at the end of the day] and [when he] comes up to eat of heave offering [he may do so because it is night]. The presumption is that he dipped while it was still day.” This applies to one who goes [up the mountain from the sea] the short way, but not concerning one who went [the long way] on the main road. What is [the duration of] “twilight”? Said Rabbi Tanhuma, “[One may define it] as [the time it takes for] a drop of blood, which was placed on the cutting edge of a sword, to split in half. That [short time span] is [the duration of] twilight.” What is [the duration of] “twilight”? “[The time from] when the sun sets until [the time it would take a person to] walk a half a mile,” the words of R. Nehemiah. R. Yose says, “Twilight is like the blink of an eye.” And the sages could not determine [the length of this last interval].

19. *Bavli Shabbat 34b-35b* (trans. Soncino)

תנו רבנן: בין השמשות ספק מן היום ומן הלילה, ספק כולו מן היום, ספק כולו מן הלילה — מטילין אותו לחומר שני ימים. ואיזהו בין השמשות? — משתשקע החמה כל זמן שפני מזרח מאדמיין. הכסוף התחתון ולא הכסוף העליון — בין השמשות. הכסוף העליון והשונה לתחתון — זהו לילה, דברי רבי יהודה. רבי נחמיה אומר: כדי שיחלה אדם משתשקע החמה חצי מיל. רבי יוסי אומר: בין השמשות כהרף עין, זה נכנס וזה יוצא, ואי אפשר לעמוד עליו...
הא גופה קשיא. אמרת איזהו בין השמשות — משתשקע החמה, כל זמן שפני מזרח מאדמיין. הא הכסוף התחתון ולא הכסוף העליון — לילה הוא. והדר תני: הכסוף התחתון ולא הכסוף העליון — בין השמשות. אמר רבה אמר רב יהודה אמר שמואל: כרוד ותני: איזהו בין השמשות — משתשקע החמה כל זמן שפני מזרח מאדמיין. והכסוף התחתון ולא הכסוף העליון — נמי בין השמשות. הכסוף העליון והשונה לתחתון — לילה. ורב יוסף אמר רב יהודה אמר שמואל, הכי קתני: משתשקע החמה כל זמן שפני מזרח מאדמיין — יום. הכסוף התחתון ולא הכסוף העליון — בין השמשות. הכסוף העליון והשונה לתחתון — לילה.

ואזדו לטעמייהו, דאיתמר: שיעור בין השמשות בכמה? אמר רבה אמר רב יהודה אמר שמואל: שלשה חלקי מיל. מאי שלשה חלקי מיל? אילימא תלתא פלגי מילא — נימא מיל ומחצה. אלא תלתא תילתי מילא — נימא מיל. אלא: תלתא ריבועי מילא. ורב יוסף אמר רב יהודה אמר שמואל: שני חלקי מיל. מאי שני חלקי מיל? אילימא תרי פלגי מילא — לימא מיל. ואלא תרי רבועי מילא — לימא חצי מיל. אלא תרי תילתי מיל. מאי בינייהו? — איכא בינייהו פלגא דדנקא.

Our Rabbis taught: As to twilight, it is doubtful whether it is partly day and partly night, or the whole of it [belongs to the] day, or the whole of it night: [therefore] it is cast upon the stringencies of both days. And what is twilight? From sunset as long as the face of the east has a reddish glow: when the lower [horizon] is pale but not the upper, it is twilight; [but] when the upper [horizon] is pale and the same as the lower, it is night: this is the opinion of R. Judah. R. Nehemiah said: For as long as it takes a man to walk half a *mil* from sunset. R. Jose said: Twilight is as the blinking of an eye, one entering and the other departing, and it is impossible to determine it...

This is self-contradictory. You say, 'What is twilight? From sunset as long as the face of the east has a reddish glow.' Hence, if the lower horizon is pale but not the upper, it is night. Then it is taught, 'When the lower [horizon] is pale but not the upper, it is twilight?' — Rabbah answered in the name of Rab Judah in Samuel's name: Combine [them] and learn: What is twilight? From sunset as long as the face of the east has a reddish glow, And if the lower [horizon] is pale but not the upper, that too is twilight. But when the upper horizon is pale and the same as the lower, it is night. While R. Joseph answered in the name of Rab Judah in Samuel's name, This is what he teaches: From sunset as long as the face of the east has a reddish glow, it is day; if the lower [horizon] is pale but not the upper, it is twilight; when the upper is pale and the same as the lower, it is night.

Now, they follow their views. For it was stated: How long is the period of twilight? — Rabbah said in the name of Rab Judah in Samuel's name. Three parts of a *mil*. What is meant by, 'three parts of a mil'? Shall we say, three half mils? Then let him say, 'A *mil* and a half'? While if it is three thirds of a *mil*, let him say, 'One mil'? Hence it must mean three quarters of a *mil*. While R. Joseph said in the name of Rab Judah in Rab's name: Two parts of a *mil*. What is 'two parts of a mil'? Shall we say, two halves: let him say, 'One mil'? while if it means two quarters of a *mil*; let him say, 'half a mil'. Hence it must mean two thirds of a *mil*. What is the difference between them? — One half of a sixth.

20. Bavli Berakhot 2b (ed. Sefaria; trans. Soncino)

ורבי מאיר הכי קאמר ליה: מי סברת דאנא אבין השמשות דידך קא אמיןא? אנא אבין השמשות דרבי יוסי קא אמיןא,
דאמר רבי יוסי בין השמשות כהרר עין, זה — נכנס, וזה — יוצא, ואי אפשר לעמוד עליו

R. Meir may reply as follows: Do you think that I am referring to the twilight [as defined] by you? I am referring to the twilight [as defined] by R. Jose. For R. Jose says: The twilight is like the twinkling of an eye. This enters and that departs — and one cannot exactly fix it.

Part IV: Drama, Danger, Dashing

21. Bavli Shabbat 33b (trans. Soncino)

בהדי פניא דמעלי שבתא חזו ההוא סבא דהוה נקיט תרי מדאני אסא ורהיט בין השמשות. אמרו ליה: הני למה לך? אמר
להו: לכבוד שבת. ותיסגי לך בחד! — חד כנגד "זכור" וחד כנגד "שמור". אמר ליה לבריה: חזי כמה חביבין מצות על
ישראל. איתיבה דעתיהו

On the eve of the Sabbath before sunset they saw an old man holding two bundles of myrtle and running at twilight. "What are these for?" they asked him. "They are in honor of the Sabbath," he replied. "But one should suffice you?" - One is for "Remember" (Exodus 20:8), and one for "Observe" (Deuteronomy 5:12). Said he to his son, "See how precious are the commandments to Israel." Thereat their minds were put at ease.

22. Bavli Ketubot 103a (trans. Soncino)

גר יהא דלוק במקומו, שולחן יהא ערוך במקומו, מטא תהא מוצעת במקומה, מאי טעמא? כל בי שמשו הוה אתי לביתיה.
ההוא בי שמשא אתאי שבכתא, קא קריה אבבא, אמרה אמתיה: שתיקו, דרבי יתיב. כיון דשמע, שוב לא אתא, שלא להוציא
לעו על צדיקים הראשונים

'The light shall continue to burn in its usual place, the table shall be laid in its usual place [and my] bed shall be spread in its usual place'. What is the reason? — He [Rabbi Judah the Patriach] used to come home again at twilight every Sabbath Eve. On a certain Sabbath Eve a neighbor came to the door speaking aloud, when his handmaid whispered, 'Be quiet for Rabbi is sitting there'. As soon as he heard this he came no more, in order that no reflection might be cast on the earlier saints.

23. Bavli Ketubot 62b (trans. Soncino)

יהודה בריה דרבי חייא, תתניה דרבי ינאי, הנה אגיל ויתב כבי רב, וכל בי שמשו קא הנה איתי לבי תיה, וכי הנה איתי, הנה קא חזי קמיה עמו דא דנורא. יומא חד משכתייה שבעתא. כיון דלא חזי הוה סימנא, אמר להו רבי ינאי: כפו מטותו, שאילמלי יהודה קיים לא ביטל עונתו. הווי כ"שגגה שיוצא מלפני השליט", ונח נפשיה

Judah the son of R. Hiyya and son-in-law of R. Jannai was always spending his time in the school house but every Sabbath eve [at twilight] he came home. Whenever he arrived the people saw a pillar of light moving before him. Once he was so attracted by his subject of study [that he forgot to return home]. Not Seeing that sign, R. Jannai said to those [around him], ‘Lower his bed, for had Judah been alive he would not have neglected the performance of his marital duties.’ This [remark] was like an error that proceedeth from the ruler, for [in consequence] Judah’s soul returned to its eternal rest.

24. Bavli Baba Qama 32a-b (trans. Soncino)

מתני' דלא כאיסי בן יהודה דתניא איסי בן יהודה אומר רץ חייב מפני שהוא משונה ומודה איסי בע"ש בין השמשות שהוא פטור מפני שרץ ברשות א"ר יוחנן הלכה כאיסי בן יהודה ומי אמר רבי יוחנן הכי והאמר ר' יוחנן הלכה כסתם משנה ותנן אחד רץ ואחד מהלך או שהיו שניהם רצין פטורין מתני' בע"ש בין השמשות ממאי מדקתני או שהיו שניהם רצין פטורין הא תו ל"ל השתא אחד רץ ואחד מהלך פטור שניהם רצין מבעיא אלא הכי קאמר אחד רץ ואחד מהלך פטור בד"א בע"ש בין השמשות אבל בחול אחד רץ ואחד מהלך חייב שניהם רצין אפי' בחול פטורין אמר מר ומודה איסי בע"ש בין השמשות שהוא פטור מפני שרץ ברשות בע"ש מאי ברשות איכא כדר' חנינא דאמר ר' חנינא בואו ונצא לקראת כלה מלכתא ואמרי לה לקראת שבת כלה מלכתא רבי ינאי מתעטף וקאי ואמר בואי כלה בואי כלה

Our Mishnah is not in accordance with Issi b. Judah. For it has been taught: Issi b. Judah maintains that the man who had been running is liable, since his conduct was unusual. Issi, however, agrees [that if it were] on a Sabbath eve before sunset there would be exemption, for running at that time is permissible.

R. Johanan stated that the *halachah* is in accordance with Issi b. Judah. But did R. Johanan [really] maintain this? Has R. Johanan not laid down the rule that the *halachah* is in accordance with [the ruling of] an anonymous Mishnah? Now, did we not learn ... “One [of them] running and the other walking or both of them running... both of them are exempt?” — Our Mishnah [deals with a case] of a Sabbath eve before sunset. What proof have you of that? — From the text, “or both of them running... both of them are exempt”; [for indeed] what need was there for this to be inserted? If in the case where one was running and the other walking there is exemption, could there be any doubt where both of them were running? It must accordingly mean thus: ‘Where one was running and the other walking there is exemption; provided, however, it was on a Sabbath eve before sunset. For if on a weekday, [in the case of] one running and the other walking there would be liability, [whereas where] both of them were running even though on a weekday they would be exempt.’ The Master stated: ‘Issi, however, agrees [that if it were] on a Sabbath eve before sunset there would be exemption, for running at that time is permissible.’ On Sabbath eve, why is it permissible? — As [shown by] R. Hanina: for R. Hanina used to say: ‘Come, let us go forth to meet the bride, the queen!’ Some [explicitly] read: ‘... to meet Sabbath, the bride, the queen.’ R. Jannai, [however,] while dressed in his Sabbath attire used to remain standing and say: ‘Come thou, O queen, come thou, O queen!’