



Kiddush and Havdalah: Marking the Boundaries of Sanctified Time

Dr. Judith Hauptman

Judith Hauptman is the E. Billi Ivry Professor Emerita of Talmud and Rabbinic Culture at The Jewish Theological Seminary. Dr. Hauptman's scholarly research focuses on two areas. The first is unraveling the mystery of how the Talmud came into being—i.e., how the many strands of rabbinic teachings coalesced into one coherent document. Her second area of research involves investigating women's roles in Judaic thought, bringing an evaluation of the social and ethical norms of the rabbinic period into dialogue with contemporary issues.

Dr. Hauptman has authored several books in the areas of her research. Her book, *Rereading the Rabbis: A Woman's Voice* is now available at no charge on Sefaria.org. In her newest volume, *The Stories They Tell, Halakhic Anecdotes in the Babylonian Talmud* (Gorgias Pr, 2022), Dr. Hauptman upends the long-held theory of the immutability of halakhah, and shows that the Talmud itself promotes halakhic change. A popular lecturer and writer, Dr. Hauptman has also authored many influential articles.

In 2004, not long after her ordination as a rabbi, she founded Ohel Ayalah, an outreach project to young Jews on the margins, named in memory of her mother. Dr. Hauptman received a degree in Talmud from the Seminary College of Jewish Studies at JTS (now Albert A. List College of Jewish Studies) and a degree in Economics from Barnard College, and earned an MA and a PhD in Talmud from JTS. In May 2003, she was ordained as a rabbi by the Academy for Jewish Religion.

I. Kiddush

K1. Mishnah Berakhot 8:1, Reciting Kiddush at a meal on Friday Night

These are the [halakhic differences] between House of Shammai and House of Hillel regarding a meal: The House of Shammai says, one [first] recites the blessing for the day [the Sabbath, i.e., Kiddush], and afterwards the blessing on wine. But the House of Hillel says, one first recites the blessing on wine and afterwards the blessing for the day [the Sabbath, i.e., Kiddush].

אלו דברים שבין בית שמאי ובית הלל בסעודה:
בית שמאי אומרים: מברך על היום ואחר כך מברך על
היין, ובית הלל אומרים: מברך על היין ואחר כך מברך
על היום.

*Oldest mention of Kiddush; not called Kiddush;
later called Kedushat Hayom, shortened to
Kiddush (K)*

K2. Tosefta Berakhot 5:2, Not interrupting a Friday afternoon meal to recite Kiddush

It once happened that Rabban Shimon ben Gamliel (RSBG) and R. Judah and R. Yossi were reclining [at a meal] in Akko and the day became sanctified [i.e., the Sabbath began]. RSBG said to R. Yosi: Master, do you wish us to interrupt the meal for the Sabbath? R. Yosi said to RSBG: Every day you favor my [halakhic] opinions [over those of R. Judah] in the presence of R. Judah and now you want to favor R. Judah's opinion [to interrupt the meal for Kiddush] in my presence?! Do you wish to conquer the queen while I am in the house (Esther 7:8)? RSBG said to him: If so, we will not interrupt the meal lest it be fixed as halakhah for generations to come. It was [later] reported: they did not budge from there until they had fixed the halakhah like R. Yosi [i.e., not to interrupt a meal to recite Kiddush].

מעשה ברבן שמעון בן גמליאל ור' יהודה ור' יוסה,
שהיו מסובין בעכו וקדש עליהן היום. אמ' לו רבן
שמעון: בן גמליאל לר' יוסי: ברבי רצונך נפסיק לשבת?
אמ' לו: בכל יום אתה מחבב דברי יהודה ועכשיו
אתה את המלכה מחבב דברי יהודה בפני? "הגם לכבוש
עמי בבית"?! אמ' לו: אם כן לא נפסיק שמא תקבע
הלכה לדורות. אמרו: לא זזו משם עד שקבעו
הלכה. כר' יוסי

*The point is that K is not regarded as establishing
the sanctity of the Sabbath but merely an
acknowledgment of arrival of Sabbath. Decision is
made to postpone K to end of the meal which
shows that the meal takes precedence.*

K3. Talmud Bavli, Pesahim 100a, Reciting Kiddush as Shabbat begins

R. Judah (BA 2) said that Shmuel (BA 1) said: the halakhah is not like R. Judah nor like R. Yosi. Rather one spreads out a cloth [to cover the food on the tray table] and recites Kiddush.

Rashbam (a 12c. Tosafist) comments: it is for this reason that it became customary to cover the hallah with a cloth until after Kiddush [is recited] on the Sabbath and festivals.

אמר רב יהודה אמר שמואל: אין הלכה לא כרבי יהודה
ולא כרבי יוסי, אלא פורס מפה ומקדש.
רשב"ם מסכת פסחים דף ק עמוד ב
ומטעם זה נהגו לפרוס מפה ללחם עד לאחר קידוש
בשבתות יו"ט.

*This means that one should acknowledge the
sanctity of the Sabbath soon after the Sabbath
begins. When cloth is removed, the meal is
automatically a Shabbat meal. Rashbam says
that this is the origin of the hallah cover.*

K4. Tosefta Berakhot 3:12, Reciting Kedushat Hayom in Prayer

On Shabbat and festivals and Yom Kippur, a person prays a seven-blessing Amidah and recites Kedushat Hayom as the middle [blessing].

בשבת וביום טוב וביום הכפורים מתפלל שבע ואו' קדושת היום באמצע.

K is recited twice: in Ma'ariv Friday night and on a cup of wine at Sabbath meal.

K5. Talmud Bavli, Pesachim 106a, Reciting daytime Kiddush on Shabbat

What blessing does a person recite on the Sabbath day? R. Judah said, *borei peri hagafen*. R. Ashi (BA 6) visited Mehoza. They said to him let the master recite for us the "Great Kiddush." They gave him [a cup of wine]. He thought [to himself], what is the "great Kiddush"? He said [to himself], for all blessings [that are part of a ritual], *borei peri hagafen* is recited first. So he recited *borei peri hagafen* and stretched it out. He saw an old man lean over and drink [wine showing that the Great Kiddush is only that one blessing!]. R. Ashi then said about himself, "a wise man's eyes are in his head" (Kohelet 2:4).

ביום מאי מברך? אמר רב יהודה: בורא פרי הגפן. רב אשי איקלע למחוזא, אמרו ליה: ליקדיש לן מר? קידושא רבה. הבו ליה. סבר: מאי ניהו קידושא רבה אמר: מכדי כל הברכות כולן בורא פרי הגפן אמרי ברישא, אמר בורא פרי הגפן ואגיד ביה. חזייה ליהוא "סבא דגחין ושתי. קרי אנפשיה "החכם עיניו בראשו

In later amoraic generations a daytime K was added. It appears that the people themselves added it. R. Ashi, a late amora, deduced their practice. But only a blessing on wine. No "Kiddush." Cannot establish the sanctity of the Sabbath in the middle of the Sabbath day.

K6. Talmud Bavli, Berakhot 20b, Women obligated to recite Kiddush

R. Ada bar Ahavah (BA 2) said: women are obligated to Kiddush, a rule of Torah. . . . Rather Rava (BA 4) said: the [Sabbath] verses say, "commemorate," (Exodus 20:8) and "observe (Deut. 5:12)." Anyone who is obligated to observe is also obligated to commemorate. And since women are obligated to observe, they are also obligated to commemorate [by reciting Kiddush].

אמר רב אדא בר אהבה: נשים חייבות בקדוש היום דבר תורה. . . .

אלא אמר רבא: אמר קרא זכור ושמור, כל שישנו בשמירה ישנו בזכירה, והני נשי הואיל ואיתנהו בשמירה איתנהו בזכירה

Obligating women to Kiddush is a way of acknowledging that Kiddush enables a person to experience the sanctity of the Sabbath.

II. Havdalah

H1. Mishnah Berakhot 5:2, Reciting Havdalah in the Amidah

One mentions . . . Havdalah in Honen Hada'at.

R. Akiba says, one says it as its own fourth blessing [of the Ma'ariv Amidah].

R. Eliezer says, [one recites the Havdalah declaration] in the prayer for thanks [i.e., the Hoda'ah, towards the end of the Amidah].

מזכירין . . . והבדלה בחונן הדעת.
ר' עקיבא אומר אומרה ברכה רביעית בפני עצמה.
רבי אליעזר אומר בהודאה:

*Saying Havdalah (H) in the Amidah
Saturday night.*

H2. Tosefta Berakhot 5:30, Havdalah as a declaration

One who enters his home Saturday night, recites a blessing on wine, on a flame, and on spices, and declares Havdalah . . .

One who is accustomed [to saying Havdalah] may declare many Havdalah statements. But one who is not accustomed should declare [just] one or two.

הנכנס לתוך ביתו במוצאי שבת מברך על היין ועל
המאור ועל הבשמים וא' הבדלה . . .

הרגיל א' הבדלות הרבה ושאינו רגיל אומ' או אחת או שתיים.
Saying Havdalah at home, often after a Saturday night meal. It is a declaration, not yet a blessing.

H3. Mishnah Berakhot 8:5, Order of Blessings after a meal Saturday night at home

The House of Shammai says: [Here is the order of blessings at the end of the Sabbath:] flame, Grace, spices, and Havdalah [declaration]. But the House of Hillel says, flame, spices, Grace, and Havdalah [declaration].

בית שמאי אומרים נר ומזון ובשמים והבדלה ובית הלל
אומרים נר ובשמים ומזון והבדלה.
We thus see that Havdalah is recited twice: in Ma'ariv and at home over a cup of wine. But why acknowledge end of Sabbath sanctity twice?

H4. Talmud Yerushalmi, Berakhot 5:2, History of Havdalah; Why recite Havdalah twice?

[Citation of Mishnah]: "And [recite the] Havdalah [declaration] in Honen Hada'at."

Simon bar Abba (JA 3) asked in the presence of R. Yohanan (JA 2): if something is [already] an ongoing practice, how can Sages still disagree about it?!

He [R. Yohanan] said to him: since the primary obligation [to recite Havdalah] is on a cup, they forgot where [to insert it] in prayer [and hence the dispute.]

"והבדלה בחונן הדעת."

שמעון בר ווא בעא קומי רבי יוחנן: דבר שהוא נוהג
ובא חכמים חולקין עליו?!?

אמר לו על ידי שעיקרה בכוס שכחיה בתפלה.

It is his [i.e., R. Yohanan's] opinion that the primary obligation [to recite Havdalah] is on a cup [of wine at home].

R. Ya'akov bar Idi [JA 2/3, said] in the name of R. Yizhaq Ruba (JA 1), if he said it [Havdalah] on a cup, he should [also] say it in prayer. [Saying it on a cup] is to benefit the children.

It is his opinion that the primary obligation to recite Havdalah is in prayer.

R. Zeira (JA 3), R. Judah (BA 2) in the name of Shmuel (BA 1): if he said [Havdalah] on a cup he [also has to] say it in prayer, and if he said it in prayer he [also] has to say it on a cup.

It is his opinion that the primary obligation is here and also here [in prayer and on a cup].

מילתיה אמרה שעיקרה בכוס.

ר' יעקב בר אידי בשם ר' יצחק רובא: אמרה בכוס אומרה בתפילה בשביל לזכות את התינוקות.

מילתיה אמרה שעיקרה בתפילה.

רבי זעירא רב יהודה בשם שמואל: אמרה בכוס אומרה בתפילה אמרה בתפילה אומרה בכוס

מילתיה אמרה שעיקרה כאן וכאן.

H5. Talmud Bavli, Berakhot 33a-b, History of Havdalah; Why recite Havdalah twice?

[Citation of Mishnah:] "R. Akiba says, he recites it [the Havdalah statement] as the fourth blessing [of the Amidah] and so on."

R. Shemen bar Abba (JA 3) said to R. Yohanan: Since the Men of the Great Assembly instituted for [the people of] Israel blessings, prayers, Kedushot, and Havdalot, let's see where they inserted [them].

He [R. Yohanan] said to him: At first they [the Men of the Great Assembly] fixed it [Havdalah] in prayer, and when they [the people] became rich, they [the Men] fixed it on a cup [of wine], but when they grew poor, they [the Men] again fixed it in prayer. And they [the Men of the Great Assembly] said, one who recites Havdalah in prayer must [also] recite it on a cup.

It was also stated by R. Hiyya bar Abba (JA 3) in the name of R. Yohanan: Since the Men of the Great Assembly instituted for [the people of] Israel blessings, prayers, Kedushot, and Havdalot, at first they [the Men] fixed it [Havdalah] in prayer, and when they [the people] grew rich they fixed it on a cup [of wine], but when they grew poor, they [the Men] again fixed it in prayer. And they [the Men] said, one who recites Havdalah in prayer must [also] recite it on a cup.

"רבי עקיבא אומר אומרה ברכה רביעית כו'."

אמר ליה רב שמן בר אבא לרבי יוחנן: מכדי אנשי כנסת הגדולה תקנו להם לישראל ברכות ותפלות קדושות והבדלות, נחזי היכן תקון.

אמר ליה: בתחילה קבעוה בתפלה, העשירו קבעוה על הכוס, הענו חזרו וקבעוה בתפלה, והם אמרו: המבדיל בתפלה צריך שיבדיל על הכוס.

Saying two Havdalahs is an ancient practice. That is its justification.

איתמר נמי אמר רבי חייא בר אבא אמר רבי יוחנן: אנשי כנסת הגדולה תקנו להם לישראל ברכות ותפלות קדושות והבדלות. בתחלה קבעוה בתפלה, העשירו קבעוה על הכוס, חזרו והענו קבעוה בתפלה, והם אמרו: המבדיל בתפילה צריך שיבדיל על הכוס.

איתמר נמי רבה ורב יוסף דאמרי תרוייהו: המבדיל בתפלה צריך שיבדיל על הכוס.

It was also stated that Rabbah (BA 3) and R. Yosef (BA 3) both said: one who recites Havdalah in prayer must [also] recite it on a cup [of wine].

....

It was also stated by R. Binyamin bar Yefet (JA 3): R. Yosi asked R. Yohanan in Zidon, and some say it was R. Shimon b. Ya'akov from Mahn Zur who asked R. Yohanan, and I [R. Binyamin bar Yefet] heard [him ask], does one who recites Havdalah in prayer need [also] recite it on a cup or not? And he [R. Yohanan] said to him: one has to recite it on a cup.

....

Ravina (BA 5) said to Rava (BA 4): what is the halakhah? [Need one say Havdalah twice?] Rava said to him: [Havdalah is] like Kiddush: just as Kiddush, even though one recites it in prayer one [also] recites it on a cup, so too Havdalah, even though one recites it in prayer, one [also] recites it on a cup.

H6. Talmud Bavli, Pesahim 54a, Havdalah as a collection of blessings and ritual acts

Rabbi [Judah Hanasi] would say them [the blessings on spices, a flame, and a Havdalah statement] separately [i.e., as the occasion arose]. R. Hiyya (JA 1) would say them successively.

R. Yizhaq bar Avdimi (JA 1) said: Even though Rabbi would say them separately, he would then arrange them [i.e., say them in succession] on a cup [of wine] to discharge the obligation of his children and his wife [to hear Havdalah].

From hereon in, no reference to Men of the Great Assembly. . . .

איתמר נמי אמר רבי בנימין בר יפת: שאל רבי יוסי את רבי יוחנן בצידן ואמרי לה רבי שמעון בן יעקב דמן צור את רבי יוחנן, ואנא שמעית: המבדיל בתפלה, צריך שיבדיל על הכוס או לא? ואמר ליה: צריך שיבדיל על הכוס

הכוס

....

אמר ליה רבינא לרבא: הלכתא מאי? אמר ליה: כי קידוש, מה קידוש אף על גב דמקדש בצלותא מקדש אכסא, אף הבדלה נמי אף על גב דמבדיל בצלותא מבדיל אכסא

Problem with R. Yohanan's comment about Men of GA: if they moved H to Amidah when people grew poor and could not buy wine, how could the same Men also say that one who says H in prayer also has to say it on a cup?! Generally it is tannaim, not amoraim, who talk about a series of early changes. Answer to why say H twice shifts from "Men of GA said so" to "H is like K": recited in prayer and at home.

רבי מפזרן, רבי חייא מכנסן.

אמר רבי יצחק בר אבדימי: אף על פי שרבי מפזרן חוזר וסודרן על הכוס, כדי להוציא בניו ובני ביתו

ביתו

This is the beginning of Havdalah as a blessing and as a term denoting a series of blessings that should be recited one after the other.

H7. Talmud Bavli, Shabbat 150b, An Abbreviated Havdalah

Mishnah: . . . One may not wait for nightfall at the edge of the Sabbath boundary to hire workers or bring in produce. But one may wait for nightfall at the edge of the Sabbath boundary to guard [his crops after the Sabbath] and bring home [some] produce in his hand

[Citation of mishnah:] "But one may wait for nightfall [at the edge of the Sabbath boundary]." [Stam (anonymous editor asks:)] [May he perform labor when the Sabbath ends] if he has not [yet] recited Havdalah?! Did not R. Eleazar b. Antigonos (JA 2) say in the name of R. Eliezer b. Ya'akov (T 5): A person is prohibited from attending to his needs [i.e., performing labor after the Sabbath ends] until he recites Havdalah?!

[Stam asks further:] And if you say he recited Havdalah in the Amidah [of Ma'ariv], did not R. Judah (BA 2) say that Shmuel (BA 1) said, one who recites Havdalah in the Amidah must also recite it over a cup [of wine]?

[Stam asks even further:] And if you say he [already] recited Havdalah on a cup [of wine], can one [find] a cup [of wine] in the field? [No!]

R. Natan bar Ammi (BA 5) explained in the presence of Rava (BA 4): It was the time of wine pressing [that the mishnah was referring to]. R. Abba (BA 6) said to R. Ashi (BA 6): In the West, [it is our practice] to say thus, "*hamavdil bein qodesh lehol*" [i.e., He who distinguishes between holiness and the profane] and we [then] attend to our needs [i.e., perform labor].

R. Ashi said: when we were at the home of R. Kahana (BA 5), [at the end of the Sabbath] he would say "*hamavdil bein qodesh lehol*" and we would [then] chop up wood.

משנה. . . אין מחשיכין על התחום לשכור לו פועלים ולהביא פירות, אבל מחשיך הוא לשמור, ומביא פירות בידו.

"אבל מחשיכין."

ואף על גב דלא אבדיל? והאמר רבי אלעזר בן אנטיגנוס משום רבי אליעזר בן יעקב: אסור לו לאדם שיעשה חפציו קודם שיבדיל!

וכי תימא דאבדיל בתפלה, והאמר רב יהודה אמר שמואל: המבדיל בתפלה צריך שיבדיל על הכוס.

וכי תימא דאבדיל על הכוס, כוס בשדה מי איכא?!

אמר רבי נתן בר אמי קמיה דרבא: בין הגיתות שנו.

אמר ליה רבי אבא לרב אשי: במערבא אמרינן הכי המבדיל בין קודש לחול ועבדינן צורכין.

אמר רב אשי: כי הוינא בי רב כהנא הוה אמר המבדיל בין קודש לחול ומסלתינן סילתי.

New rule: one cannot perform labor until after reciting H both in prayer and at home, for benefit of family. If one is not at home at the end of the Sabbath, he can recite a very short place-holder Havdalah and then a full Havdalah when he arrives home.