

# Talmudic Writings on the Passage from This Life to the Next

## Dr. David Kraemer

Dr. David Kraemer is the Joseph J. And Dora Abbell Librarian and Professor of Talmud and Rabbinics at JTS. David Kraemer has been part of JTS since 1977 when he enrolled at The Graduate School after completing his undergraduate degree at Brandeis University. He began teaching as a graduate student in 1980, receiving his PhD in 1984. Dr. Kraemer's focus as a professor is on the literary analysis of rabbinic literature, rabbinic ritual, and the social and religious history of Jews in late antiquity. He accepted the position of Librarian in 2004 and has since played a crucial role in forging policy and expanding the impact of the Library's world-renowned collections and programs.

Dr. Kraemer is a prolific author and commentator. His books include A History of the Talmud; Jewish Eating and Identity Through the Ages, The Meanings of Death in Rabbinic Judaism; Reading the Rabbis: The Talmud as Literature, and Responses to Suffering in Classical Rabbinic Literature. In addition to his books, he has written influential articles on the biblical books of Ezra and Nehemiah, the Mishnah, and other subjects.

#### **Jerusalem Talmud Moed Qatan 3:5**

דְּבַר קַפָּרָא אָמַר. אֵין תּוֹקְפּוֹ שֶׁלְאֵבֶל אֶלֶּא עַד שֵׁלֹשָׁה יָמִים רִבִּי אבָּא בְּרֵיהּ דְּרָבִּי פַּפֵּי רְבִּי יְהוֹשֻעַ דְּסִיכְנִין בְּשֵׁם רְבִּי לֵוִי. כָּל־תְּלָתָא יוֹמִין נַפְשָׁא טַייְסָא עַל גּוּפָא סְבִירָה דְהִיא חָזְרָה לְגַבֵּיהּ. כֵּיוָן דְּהִיא חַמְייָא דְּאִישְׁתַּנֵּי זִיוֵיהוֹן דְּאַפּוי הִיא שֶׁבְקָא לֵיהּ וְאָזְלָה לָה אָבֵל כָּל־זְמֵן שֶׁמֵּתוֹ מוּטַל לְפָנָיו אוֹכֵל אֶצֶל חֲבֵירוֹ. אֵין לוֹ חֶבֵר אוֹכֵל בְּבַיִת אַחֵר. אֵין לוֹ בַּיִת אָחֵר עוֹשֶׁהָ מְחִיצָה וְאוֹכֵל. אָם אֵינוֹ יָכוֹל לַעֲשׁוֹת מְחִיצָה הוֹפֵּךְ אֶת פָּנִיו בְּנָגֶד חַכִּוֹתֶל

בַּיִּת אַחֵר עוֹשֶּׂה מְחִיצָה וְאוֹבֶל. אִם אֵינוֹ יָכוֹל לַעְשוֹת מְחִיצָה הוֹפֵּךְ אֶּת ׁפְּנָיוֹ פְּנָגֶד הַפּוֹתֶל וְאוֹכֵל. וְאֵינוֹ לֹא מֵיסַב וְאוֹכֵל. וְלֹא אוֹכֵל כָּל־צוֹרְכוֹ. וְלֹא שׁוֹתֶה כָל־צוֹרְכוֹ. וְלֹא אוֹכֵל בָּשְׁר וְלֹא שׁוֹתֶה יַיִּוְ. וְאֵין מְזַמְנִין עָלָיו. וְאִם בִּירַךּ אֵין עוֹנִין אַחֲרָיו אָמֵן. וַאֲחֵרִים שְׁבִּירְכוּ אֵינוֹ עוֹנֶה אַחֲרִיהֶן אָמֵן. בַּמֶּה דְּבָרִים אֲמוּרִים. בַּחוֹל. אָבָל בַּשַּׁבָּת מֵיסַב וְאוֹכֵל. וְאוֹכֵל בָּל־צוֹרְכוֹ. וְשׁוֹתֶה כָל־צוֹרְכוֹ. וְאוֹכֵל בָּשָׂר וְשׁוֹתֶה יַיִּן. וּמְזַמְנִין עָלָיו. וְאִם בִּירַדְּ עוֹנִין אַחֲרָיו אָמֵן. וַאֲחֵרִים שֶׁבִּירְכוּ עוֹנֶה אַחֲרֵיהֶן אָמֵן

- [D] Bar Qappara has said, "Mourning retains its power over the mourner for only three days."
- [E] R. Abba son of R. Pappi, R. Joshua of Sikhnin in the name of R. Levi: "For the first three days after death, the soul flutters over the body, thinking that she will return to it. When she sees that the appearance of the corpse deteriorates, she leaves the body and goes her way."
- [I:10 A] With regard to a mourner, so long as his deceased is lying [unburied] before him, he eats with a fellow.
- [B] If he has no fellow, he eats in some other house.
- [C] If he has no other house, he sets up a partition and eats.
- [D] If he cannot set up a partition, he turns away and faces the wall and eats.
- [E] In any event he does not recline and eat, nor does he eat to satiety, nor does he drink to satiety,
- [F] nor does he eat meat or drink wine.
- [G] They do not include him in a quorum for grace after meals.
- [H] If he said a blessing, they do not say after him, "Amen."
- [I] And as to others who said a blessing, he does not say after them, "Amen."
- [J] Under what circumstances do these rules apply?
- [K] In the case of an ordinary day.
- [L] But on the Sabbath he reclines and eats, he eats to satiety, he drinks to satiety, he eats meat and drinks wine, they include him in a quorum for saying grace, and if he said a blessing, they answer, "Amen," after him. If others said a blessing, he answers after them, "Amen."

```
הַכַּר מְתַּחָתָּיו, וּמְטִילִין אוֹתוֹ עַל הַחוֹל בְּשִׁבִיל
 ַ שַּיַמִתִּין. קוֹשָׁרִין אֵת הַלֵּחִי, לֹא שֵׁיַעֲלֶה, אֱלָא שֵׁלֹא יוֹסִיף. וָכֵן קוֹרָה שֵׁנִּשִׁבְּרָה — סוֹמִכִין
                                אוֹתָהּ בָּסַפָּסָל אוֹ בַּאֲרוּכּוֹת הַמְּטָה, לֹא שֵׁתַּעֵלֵה, אֵלָּא שֵׁלֹּא תּוֹסִיף
מַתָּנִיי אֶין מָעַצְמִין אֶת הַמֶּת בַּשַּׁבַּת, וָלֹא בַּחוֹל עָם יִצִיאַת נֵפֶשׁ. וָהַמְעַצִּים עָם יִצִיאַת הַנֶּפֶשׁ
                                                                                             – הַרֵי זָה שׁוֹפֵךְ דַּמִים
           ָּגָבָּה תָּנוּ רַבָּנַן : הַמְעַצִּמוֹ עִם יִצִיאַת הַנָּפֵשׁ — הֲרֵי זֵה שׁוֹפֵךְ דָּמִים. מָשָׁל לְנֵר שֵׁכָּבָה
                                                         וָהוֹלֵכֶת, אָדָם מַנִּיחַ אֵצְבָּעוֹ עָלֵיהָ — מִיָּד כָּבִתְה
   ּוָאָמַר רַבִּי יִצְחָק: קַשָּׁה רִימָּה לַמֵּת כִּמַחַט בַּבָּשָּׁר הַחַי, שֵׁנֵּאֵמַר: ייאַדְּ בִּשָּׁרוֹ עָלָיו יִכְאָביי.
  ּ אָמַר רַב חִסְדָּא : נַפְשׁוֹ שֶׁל אָדָם מִתְאַבֶּלֶת עָלָיו כָּל שִׁבְעָה, שֶׁנֶּאֱמֵר : ייְוַנַפְשׁוֹ עָלָיו תֶּאֱבָליי,
                                                                    וּכָתִיב: ייוַיַּעַשׂ לְאָבִיו אֵבֵל שִׁבְעַת יָמִיםיי
 אָמַר רַב יִהוּדָה : מֵת שֵׁאֵין לוֹ מִנַחֲמִין — הוֹלְכִין עֲשָׂרָה בָּנֵי אָדָם וִיוֹשִׁבִין בִּמְקוֹמוֹ. הָהוּא
                                                     דָשָׁכֶיב בָּשָׁבַבוּתֵיה דְּרַב יִהוּדַה, לֹא הַיוּ לוֹ מִנַחַמִין,
  בֶּל יוֹמָא הַנָה דָּבַר רַב יִהוּדָה בֵּי עַשְּׂרָה, וִיָתִבִי בִּדוּכִתֵּיהֹ. לְאַחַר שִׁבְעָה יָמִים אִיתִחַזִי לֵיהּ
                                    בָּחֵילְמֵיה דָרַב יִהוּדָה, וַאֲמַר לֵיהּ : תָּנוּחַ דַּעִתִּדְ שֵׁהְנַּחָתָּ אֵת דַּעִתִּ
    אָמַר רַבִּי אֵבָהוּ : כָּל שֵׁאוֹמָרִים בִּפְנֵי הַמֵּת, יוֹדֵעַ, עַד שֵׁיִּסְתֵם הַגּוֹלֵל. פָּלִיגִי בַּהּ רַבִּי חִיָּיא
               ּוָרַבִּי שִׁמְעוֹן בִּרַבִּי. חַד אָמַר : עַד שִׁיּסֶתֵם הַגּוֹלֵל, וְחַד אָמַר : עַד שֵׁיִּתְעַכֵּל הַבָּשָׂר.
    ַמַאן דְּאָמֵר עַד שֶׁיִּתְעַכֵּל הַבָּשָּׁר, דִּכְתִיב: ייאַדְ בְּשָּׂרוֹ עָלָיו יִכְאָב וְנַפְשׁוֹ עָלָיו תֶּאֱבָליי. מַאן
                         ּדְאָמַר עַד שֶׁיִּסְתֵם הַגּוֹלֵל, דְּכְתִיב: ייְוָיָשוֹב הֶעָפָר עַל הָאָרֵץ כְּשֵׁהָיָה וְגוֹייי
תַּנָיָא, רַבִּי אֵלִיעֵזֶר אוֹמֶר: נִשִּׁמֶתָן שֵׁל צַדִּיקִים גְּנוּזוֹת תַּחַת כְּסֵא הַכָּבוֹד, שֵׁנָאֱמֵר: ייִוְהָיִתָּה
ַנְפָשׁ אֲדֹנִי צְרוּרָה בָּצְרוֹר הַחַיִּים״. וְשֵׁל רְשָׁעִים זוֹמְמוֹת וְהוֹלְכוֹת, [וּמַלְאָךְ אֶחָד עוֹמֶד בְּסוֹף
    ָהָעוֹלָם, וּמַלְאָדְּ אַחֵר עוֹמֵד בְּסוֹף הָעוֹלָם, וּמְקַלְּעִין נִשְּׁמָתָן זֶה לָזֶה,] שֶׁנֶּאֱמֵר: ייוְאֵת נֶפֶשׁ
                                                                              אוֹיָבֵידְּ יִקַלְעָנַּה בִּתוֹדְ כַּף הַקַּלַעיי
 אָמַר לֵיהּ רַבָּה לְרַב נַחְמָן: שֶׁל בֵּינוֹנִים מַאי? אַמַר לֵיהּ: אִיכּוֹ שָׁכֵיבָנָא, לָא אַמַרי לִכוּ הַאי
 מִילָתָא, הָכִי אָמַר שִׁמוּאֵל: אֵלוּ וָאֵלוּ לִדוּמָה נִמְסָרִין. הַלָּלוּ, יֵשׁ לָהֵן מָנוֹחַ. הַלָּלוּ, אֵין לָהֵן
                                                                                                                   מַנוֹתַ
    ָהַנָהוּ קַפּוֹלַאֵי דַּהַווֹ קַפָּלִי בָּאַרְעַא דָרָב נַחְמַן. נְחַר בָּהוּ רַב אַחַאי בַּר יאשִיָּה. אַתוֹ וַאֲמַרוּ
  ֶלֵיהּ לְרַב נַחְמָן : נְחַר בַּן גַּבְרָא. אֲתָא וַאֲמַר לֵיהּ : מַאן נִיהוּ מָר? אֲמַר לֵיהּ : אֲנָא אַחַאי בַּר
     יאשִׁיָּה. אֲמַר לֵיהּ: וְלָאו אָמַר רַב מָרִי: עֲתִידִי צַדִּיקֵי דְּהָווּ עַפְּרָא! אֲמַר לֵיהּ: וּמַנִּי מָרִי
               דָּלָא יָדַעְנָא לֵיהּ! אֵמַר לֵיהּ: וְהָא קָרָא כִּתִיב: ייִונָשׁוֹב הֵעָפָר עַל הָאָרֵץ כִּשִּׁהָיָה!יי
     ָאַמַר לֵיהּ : דָּאַקְרָיָיךְ לְהֶלֶת, לָא אַקְרְיָיךְ מִשְׁלֵי, דְּכָתִיב : יוּרְקַב עֵצָמוֹת קִנְאָהיי. כָּל מִי
      ּ שַׁיֵּשׁ לוֹ קָנָאָה בִּלְבּוֹ — עַצִמוֹתָיו מַרְקִיבִים, כֹּל שֵׁאֵין לוֹ קָנָאָה בִּלְבּוֹ — אֵין עַצְמוֹתָיו
                                                                                                             מַרַקּיבִים
  ַנַּשִּׁעִיהּ, חַזְיֵיהּ דְּאִית בֵּיהּ מְשָּׁשָּׁא. אֲמַר לֵיהּ : לֵיקוּם מָר לְנַוֵּויהּ דְּבֵיתָא. אֲמַר לֵיהּ : נַּלֵּית
     ַאַדַּעָתַּדְ דַּאַפִילּוּ נָבִיאֵי לָא קָרֵית, דָּכָתִיב: ייוִידַעָתֵּם כִּי אֵנִי הי בִּפָּתָחִי אֶת קבָרוֹתֵיכֶםיי
    אַמַר לֵיהּ, וָהַכְתִּיב: ״כִּי עָפָר אַתָּה וָאֵל עָפָר תָּשׁוּבײ! אֵמַר לֵיהּ: הָהוּא שָׁעָה אַחַת קוֹדֵם
                                                                                                     תַּחַיַּית הַמַּתִים
        ּאֲמַר לֵיהּ : הָתָם בְּתוֹךְ שְׁנֵים עָשָּׁר חֹדֶשׁ הֲוָה, דְתַנְיָא : כָּל שְׁנֵים עָשָּׁר חֹדֶשׁ גּוּפוֹ קַיָּים,
                                              וְנִשִּׁמַתוֹ עוֹלֶה וְיוֹרֶדֶת. לְאַחַר שָׁנֵים עָשַּׁר חֹדֵשׁ הַגּוּף בַּטֵל
                                                                              וְנִשִּׁמֶתוֹ עוֹלָה, וְשׁוּב אֵינָהּ יוֹרֵדֵת
  אָמַר רַב יְהוּדָה בְּרֵיהּ דְּרַב שְׁמוּאֵל בַּר שִׁילַת מִשְּׁמֵיהּ דְּרַב: מֵהֵסְפֵּדוֹ שֵׁל אָדָם נִיכָּר אָם בֵּן
              ָהָעוֹלֶם הַבָּא הוּא, אָם לָאו. אִינִי? וְהָאֲמֵר לֵיהּ רַב לְרַב שְׁמוּאֵל בַּר שִׁילַת: אַחֵים
   ַבָּהֵסְפֵּידָא, דְּהָתָם קָאֵימָנָא! לָא קַשִּׁיָא: הָא — דְּמָחַמּוּ לֵיהּ וְחָאֵים. הָא — דִּמְחַמּוּ לֵיהּ
                                                                                                           וָלַא חַאֵים
```

**מַתְנִיי** עוֹשִׂין כָּל צָרְכֵי הַמֵּת : סָכִין וּמִדִיחִין אוֹתוֹ, וּבִלְבַד שֵׁלֹא יָזִיז בּוֹ אֵבֶר. שׁוֹמְטִין אֵת

- A. They prepare all that is needed for a corpse.
- B. They anoint and rinse it,
- C. on condition that they not move any limb of the corpse.
- D. They remove the mattress from under it.
- E. And they put it on [cool] sand so that [151B] it will keep.
- F. They tie the chin,
- G. not so that it will go up, but so that it will not droop [further].
- H. And so in the case of a beam which broke —
- I. they support it with a bench or the beams of a bed,
- J. not so that it will go up, but so that it will not droop further.
- K. They do not close the eyes of a corpse on the Sabbath,
- L. nor on an ordinary day at the moment the soul goes forth.
- M. And he who closes the eyes of a corpse at the moment the soul goes forth, lo, this one sheds blood.
- **I.1** A. *Our rabbis have taught on Tannaite authority:* 
  - B. He who closes the eyes of a dying man as the soul goes forth lo, such a one sheds blood. The matter may be compared to a flame that is flickering out; if someone put his finger on it, it goes out at once.
    - I.32 A. And said R. Isaac, "The worm causes pain for the corpse as much as does a needle in the flesh of a living person: 'But his flesh upon him who has pain' (Job 14:22)."
    - **I.33** A. Said R. Hisda, "A man's soul mourns for him for seven days: 'And his soul mourns for him' (Job 14:22), 'and he made a mourning for his father seven days' (Gen. 50:10)."
- **I.34** A. Said R. Judah, "In the case of a deceased for whom there are no *comforters*, ten people go and sit in the place in which he died [and do the obsequies]."
  - B. There was the case of someone who died in the neighborhood of R. Judah. There was no survivor to be comforted. [152B] Every day Rab Judah assembled ten men and they sat in his place. After seven days the deceased appeared to him in a dream and said to him, "May your mind be at rest, for you set my mind at rest."
- **I.35** A. Said R. Abbahu, "Whatever they say in the presence of the deceased he knows until the sealing stone closes his grave."
  - B. There was a dispute in this matter between R. Hiyya and R. Simeon b. Rabbi. One said, "Until the sealing stone is placed over his grave," the other said, "until the flesh rots away."
  - C. And as to the other, who said, "until the flesh rots away," "But his flesh upon him has pain and his soul within him mourns."
  - D. As to the one who said, "Until the sealing stone is placed over his grave," "and the dust return to the earth as it was and the spirit returns to God" (Qoh. 12:7).
- **I.37** A. It has been taught on Tannaite authority:
  - B. R. Eliezer says, "The souls of the righteous are hidden away under the throne of glory: 'Yet the soul of my lord shall be bound up in the bundle of

life with the Lord your God' (1 Sam. 25:29). And those of the wicked are kept in prison. One angel stands at one end of the world, and another angel stands at the other end of the world, and they sling their souls from one to the other: 'And the souls of your enemies, them shall he sling out, as from the hollow of a sling' (1 Sam. 25:29)."

- C. Said Rabbah to R. Nahman, "So what about the middling ones?"
- D. He said to him, "If I'd not died, I couldn't have told you this fact: This is what Samuel said, 'These and those [the souls of the middling and of the wicked] are handed over to Dumah. These get rest, those get no rest."
- **I.39** A. Some grave-diggers were digging in the earth at R. Nahman's. **R. Ahai bar Josiah snorted at them**. They came and told R. Nahman, "Somebody snorted at us." He came and said to him, "Who are you?"
  - B. He said to him, "I am Ahai bar Josiah."
  - C. He said to him, "Well, didn't R. Mari say, 'The righteous are destined to be dust'?"
  - D. He said to him, "So who's Mari? I know nothing of him!"
  - E. He said to him, "But there is a verse of Scripture that makes the point: 'And the dust return to the earth as it was' (Qoh. 12:7)."
  - F. He said to him, "So whoever taught you the Scriptures of Qohelet didn't teach you the Scriptures of Proverbs, where it is written, 'but envy is the rottenness of the bones' (Prov. 14:30): Whoever has envy in his heart his bones rot. Whoever has no envy in his heart his bones don't rot."
  - G. [Nahman] touched him and saw that he was substantial. He said to him, "May the master rise and come to my house?"
  - H. He said to him, "You've shown that you haven't even studied the prophets: 'And you shall know that I am the Lord when I open your graves' (Ezek. 37:13)."
  - I. He said to him, "But isn't it also written, 'for dust you are and to dust you shall return' (Gen. 3:19)?"
  - J. He said to him, "That applies a moment before the resurrection of the dead."
- **I.40** B. He said to him, "It was done within twelve months of death."
  - C. For it has been taught on Tannaite authority:
  - D. For the full twelve months after death, the body still endures, and the soul goes up and goes down. After twelve months, the body is null, [153A] and the soul goes up but doesn't go down again.
- **I.41** A. Said R. Judah b. R. Samuel bar Shila in the name of Rab, "On the basis of the funeral eulogy of a person, it is known whether he is destined to the world to come or not."
  - B. Well, now, is that so? But didn't Rab say to R. Samuel bar Shila, "Be enthusiastic in my eulogy, for I'll be standing right there on the spot!"
  - C. No problem, in the one case a warm-hearted eulogy is given and is found moving, in the other, a warm-hearted eulogy is given and is not found moving.

#### Babylonian Talmud Berakhot 18a-b

רָבִּי חָיָּיא וְרַבִּי וֹנָתָן הֲוֹוֹ שְׁקְלִי וְאָזְלִי בְּבֵית הַקְּבָרוֹת. הֲנָה קְשַׁדְיָא תְּכֵלְתָּא דְרַבִּי וֹנָתָן.
אֲמַר לֵיהּ רַבִּי חִיָּיא: דַּלְיַיהּ, כְּדֵי שֶׁלֹּא יֹאמְרוּ: לְמָחֶר בָּאִין אֶצְלֵנוּ, וְעַכְשָׁיו מְחָרְפִין אוֹתָנוּ
אֲמַר לֵיהּ וּמִי יָדְעִי כּוּלֵי הַאי: וְהָא כְּתִיב: ייְוְהַמֵּתִים אֵינָם יוֹדְעִים מְאוּמָהיי! אֲמֵר לֵיהּ: אָם שָׁנִיתָ. אִם שָׁנִיתָ. אִם שְׁנִיתָ — לֹא שִׁלַשְׁתָּ. אִם שְׁלַשְׁתָּ — לֹא שָּׁלַשְׁתָּ — לֹא פֵּירְשׁוּ לְךְּ. ייכִּי הַחַיִּים יוֹדְעִים שְׁיָּמוֹתוּיִי — אֵלוּ צַדִּיקִים שֶׁבְּמִיתָתֶן נְקְרְאוּ חַיִּים
בְּנֵי רַבִּי חִיָּיִא נְפוּק לְקְרְיָנִתָא. אִייַּקַר לְהוּ תַּלְמוּדְיִיהוּ. הֲוֹוֹ קְא מִצְעֲרִי לְאִדְּכוֹרֵיהּ. אֲמֵר לֵיהּ אִידַּדְּ: מְנָא יָדַעי וְהָא כְּתִיב: ייִיּרְבְּדוּ בְּנָיוֹ וְלָא יָדַעי וְהָא כְּתִיב: ייִאַךְ בְּשָׁרוֹ עָלָיו יִכְאָב וְנַפְשׁוֹ עָלָיו תָּאֶבָּליי. וְאָמֵר בְּיִי יִאַף בְּשָׁרוֹ עָלָיו יִכְאָב וְנַפְשׁוֹ עָלָיו תָּאֶבָּליי. וְאָמֵר צִיִּבִי יִצְּחָך: לְיָא יָדַעי וְהָא כְּתִיב: ייִאַךְ בְּשִׁרוֹ עָלָיו יִכְאָב וְנַפְשׁוֹ עָלָיו תָּאֲבָליי. וְאָמֵר יִיִּבּי יִצְּחָך: לְאָא יָדַעי וְהָא כְּמִחַ בְּמָחֵ בּבָּשִׁר הָחֵיי יִבְיּיה וְנִבְשׁוֹ לְמָבִי וְנִבְּשׁוֹ לְמָבְי יִצְאָר וְנִבְּשׁוֹ לְבָיוֹ תְּבְבִיי וֹנְנִים בְּמִים בְּבְּשִׁיר וְנִבְשׁוֹ לְנָיוֹ תָּנְאבְיי. וְאָמָר בְמִים לְּבִילִי וְנְאָשׁוֹ רְמָה לְמָה לָמָת כְּמַחַט בָּבְּשִׁר הָחֵיי

אָמָרִי: בָּצַעַרָא דִידָהוּ — יָדִעִי, בָּצַעַרָא דְאַחַרִינָא — לָא יָדְעִי אָמָרִי: בָּצַעַרָא דִידָהוּ

ּ הָתַנָיָא : מַעֲשֵׂה בָּחָסִיד אֱחָד שַׁנַּתַן דִּינַר לְעָנִי בִּעֵרב ראשׁ הַשָּׁנָה בִּשִּׁנֵי בַצוֹרֵת, וְהִקְנִיטַתּוּ אָשָׁתּוֹ, וָהַלַדְּ וָלַן בִּבֵּית הַקּבַרוֹת. וָשַׁמַע שָׁתֵּי רוּחוֹת שֶׁמְסַפִּרוֹת זוֹ לַזוֹ. אַמְרַה חֲדַא ַלַחֲבֶּרְתַּהֹּ : חֲבֶרְתִּי, בּוֹאָי וָנָשׁוּט בַּעוֹלַם, וְנִשְּׁמַע מֶאֵחוֹרֵי הַפַּרְגּוֹד מַה פּוּרְעַנוּת בַּא לַעוֹלַם: אַמָרָה לַהּ חַבַּרְתַּה: אֵינִי יָכוֹלָה, שָאַנִי קבוּרָה בָּמַחָצֵלֶת שֶל קַנִים. אֶלֶא לָכִי אַתּ, וּמַה שָׁאַתִּ שׁוֹמַעַת אָמָרִי לִי. הַלְכַה הִיא וְשָׁטַה וּבַאַה. וְאַמְרַה לַהּ חֲבֶרְתַּהּ: חֲבֶרְתִּי, מַה שַּׁמַעִתּ מְאַחוֹרֵי הַפַּרְגּוֹדִי אָמָרָה לָהּ : שָׁמַעִתִּי שֶׁכָּל הַזּוֹרֵעַ בִּרְבִיעָה רְאשׁוֹנָה בָּרָד מַלְקָה אוֹתוֹ. הָלַדְ הוּא וְזָרַע בִּרְבִיעָה שִׁנִיָּה. שֵׁל כָּל הָעוֹלֶם כּוּלוֹ לָקָה, שֵׁלוֹ — לֹא לָקָה. לַשָּׁנָה הָאַחֱרֵת הָלַדְּ ּוָלַן בָּבֵית הַקָּבַרוֹת, וְשַׁמַע אוֹתַן שְׁתֵּי רוּחוֹת שֶׁמְסַפִּרוֹת זוֹ עִם זוֹ. אַמָרָה חֲדָא לַחֲבֶרְתַּהּ בּוֹאָי וְנַשׁוּט בַּעוֹלֶם וְנִשְׁמַע מָאָחוֹרֵי הַפַּרְגוֹד מַה פּוּרְעַנוּת בַּא לַעוֹלֶם. אַמְרָה לָהּ: חַבֶּרְתִּי, לֹא כַּךְ אָמַרְתִּי לָדְּ, אֵינִי יִכוֹלָה שֵׁאַנִי קבוּרָה בִּמַחְצֵלֶת שֵׁל קַנִים!! אֵלֶא לְכִי אַתִּ, וּמַה שֵּׁאַתִּ שוֹמַעַת בּוֹאִי וָאָמָרִי לִי. הַלְכָה וְשַׁטַה וּבַאַה. וָאַמְרַה לַהּ חֲבֶרְתַּהּ: חֲבֶרְתִּי, מַה שַּׁמַעִתְּ ָמָאַחוֹרֵי הַפַּרְגוֹדִי אָמָרָה לָהּ : שָׁמַעִתִּי שֵׁכָּל הַזּוֹרֵעַ בִּרְבִיעָה שִׁנְיָה שְׁדָּפוֹן מַלְקָה אוֹתוֹ. הַלַדְ וְזַרַע בִּרְבִיעַה רָאשׁוֹנָה, שֵׁל כַּל הַעוֹלֶם כּוּלוֹ נִשְׁדַּף וְשֵׁלוֹ לֹא נִשְׁדַּף. אֲמָרַה לוֹ אִשְׁתּוֹ : מִפְּנֵי מָה אֵשְׁתַּקָד שֵׁל כַּל הַעוֹלָם כּוּלוֹ לָקָה וְשֵׁלְדָּ לֹא לַקָה, וְעַכְשֵׁיוֹ שֵׁל כַּל הַעוֹלָם כּוּלוֹ נִשְׁדַף וְשֵׁלְּךָּ לֹא נִשְׁדַּףִ? סָח לָהּ כָּל הַדְּבָרִים הַלָּלוּ. אָמְרוּ : לֹא הַיוּ יָמִים מוּעַטִים עַד שֵׁנַפְלָה קטַטַה בֵּין אָשָׁתּוֹ שֵׁל אוֹתוֹ חַסִיד וּבֵין אָמַהּ שֵׁל אוֹתַהּ רִיבַה. אַמְרַה לַהּ : לִכִי וְאַרְאֵדְ בְּתֵּדְ שָׁהִיא קבוּרָה בִּמַחָצֵלֶת שֵׁל קַנִים. לַשַּׁנָה הַאֲחֶרֶת הַלַּדְּ וָלַן בָּבֵית הַקְּבַרוֹת וְשַׁמֵע אוֹתַן רוּחוֹת שֵׁמְסַפְּרוֹת זוֹ עִם זוֹ. אָמְרָה לָהּ: חֲבֶרְתִּי, בּוֹאִי וְנָשׁוּט בָּעוֹלָם וְנִשִּׁמַע מֵאֵחוֹרֵי הַפַּרְגּוֹד מַה פּוּרְעַנוּת בַּא לַעוֹלֶם. אַמְרָה לָהּ : חֲבֵרְתִּי, הַנִּיחִינִי, דְּבַרִים שֶׁבֵּינִי לְבֵינֵךְ כְּבַר ַנִשְׁמַעוּ בֵּין הַחַיִּים. אַלְמַא יַדְעִי. דִּילְמַא אִינִישׁ אַחַרִינַא שַׁכֵיב, וְאַזֵיל וְאַמַר לְהוּ.

- **I.6** A. R. Hiyya and R. Jonathan were discoursing while walking in a cemetery. The blue fringes [of the show-fringes] of R. Jonathan were trailing on the ground. Said R. Hiyya to him, "Lift them up, so that [the dead] should not say, 'Tomorrow they are coming to us, and now they are ridiculing us.'"
- B. He said to him, "Do the dead know so much as that? And lo, it is written, 'But the dead do not know a thing' (Ecc.. 9:5)."
- C. He said to him, "If you have studied Scripture, you have not reviewed what you learned, and if you reviewed what you learned, you failed to do it a third time, and if you did it a third time, then people did not explain the meaning to you.
- D. "For the living know that they shall die' (Ecc. 9:5) refers to the righteous, for, when they have died, they still are called the living.
- **I.7** A. The sons of R. Hiyya went out to their villages, and their learning became difficult for them. They made great efforts to remember. One said to his fellow, "Does father know about this trouble of ours?"
- B. The other said to him, "How would he know? And lo, it is written, 'His sons come to honor and he does not know it' (Job 14:21)."
- C. He said to him, "But does he not know? Is it not written, 'But his flesh grieves for him and his soul mourns over him' (Job 14:22). And [commenting on this passage], R. Isaac said, 'The worm causes pain for the corpse as much as does a needle in the flesh of a living person.'"
- D. [The other answered], "They know their own suffering but not the suffering of others."

#### **I.8**

- A. And that is not so [that the deceased know the suffering of others]. For has it not been taught on Tannaite authority:
- B. M<sup>c</sup>SH B: A certain pious man gave a denar to a poor person on the event of the New Year during a time of failure. His wife scolded him, so he went and spent the night in a cemetery. He heard two spirits talking with one another. One said to her friend, "My friend, come and let us flit through the world and listen behind the veil to learn what sort of punishment is going to come upon the world."
- C. Her friend said to her, "I cannot do so, since I am buried in a mat of reeds [and not in linen]. But you go, and tell me whatever you hear."
- D. She went and flitted about and came back, and [the one who had remained] said to her friend, "My friend, what did you hear from behind the veil?"
- E. She said to her, "I heard that whoever sows his seed in the time of the first rain [will lose out, for] the crop will be ruined by hail."
- F. The man went and sowed at the time of the second rains. The crops of everyone else were smitten but his were not smitten.
- G. The next year he went and spent the night in the cemetery and heard those same two spirits talking with one another. One said to her friend, "Come and let us flit about the world and listen from behind the veil to find out what sort of punishment is coming upon the world."
- H. Her friend said to her, "My friend, did I not tell you that I cannot do so, for I am buried in matting of reeds? But you go and come back and tell me what you hear."
- I. She went and flitted about and came back, and her friend said to her, "My friend, what did you hear from behind the veil?"

- J. She said to her, "I heard that whoever sows his crop in the time of the second rain [will lose out, for] the crop will be smitten with blight."
- K. The man went and sowed his seed in the time of the first rain. The crop of everyone else was smitten with blight, but his was not smitten with blight.
- L. His wife said to him, "How is it the case that last year everyone's crop was smitten and yours was not smitten, and this year too, everyone else's crop was blighted and yours was not blighted?
- M. He told her this entire story. They say that the days were only a few before there was a quarrel between the wife of that pious man and the mother of that girl [who had died and whose spirit had been heard by the pious man in conversation]. The woman said, "Go, and I shall show you your daughter, buried in matting of reeds!"
- N. The next year the man went and spent the night in the cemetery and heard the spirits talking with one another. One said to the other, "My friend, come and let us flit about the world and listen from behind the veil to find out what sort of punishment is coming upon the world."
- O. She said to her, "My friend, leave me alone. The things that were said between you and me have already been heard among the living."
- P. What follows from this story is that the dead do know [what goes on].
- Q. Perhaps someone else died and went and told them what had happened.

### Babylonian Talmud Yoma 86a

שָׁאַל רַבִּי מַתְּיָא בֶּן חָרָשׁ אֶת רַבִּי אֶלְעָזָר בֶּן עֲזַרְיָה בְּרוֹמִי: שָׁמַעְתָּ אַרְבָּעָה חִלּוּקֵי כַפָּרָה שְׁהַיָּה רַבִּי יִשְׁמָעֵאל דּוֹרֵשׁ! אָמַר: שְׁלֹשָׁה הֵן, וּתְשׁוּבָה עם כְּל אֶחָד וְאֶחָד. עָבַר עַל עֲשֵׁה וְשָׁב — אֵינוֹ זָז מִשָּׁם עַד שֶׁמּוֹחֲלִין לוֹ, שֶׁנֶּאֱמַר: יישׁוּבוּ בָּנִים שׁוֹבָבִיםיי. עָבַר עַל לֹא תַעֲשֶׂה וְשְׁשִּׁה תְּשׁוּבָה — תְּשׁוּבָה תּוֹלָה, וְיוֹם הַכִּפּוּרִים מְכַפֵּר. שֶׁנֶּאֱמַר: ייכִּי בַּיּוֹם הַזֶּה יְטִבֶּר עַל לֹא תַעֲשֶׂה עֲלֵיכֶם מִכֹּל חֲטֹאתֵיכֶםיי. עָבַר עַל כָּרִיתוֹת וּמִיתוֹת בֵּית דְּיוֹ וְעָשֶׂה תְּשׁוּבָה — תְּשׁוּבָה וְיוֹם הַכִּפּוּוֹרִים תּוֹלִין, וְיִפּוּרִין מְמֶרְקִין. שְׁנֶּאֱמֵר: ייוּפְקַדְּתִי בְשֵׁבֶט פִּשְׁעָם וּבִנְגָעִים עְוֹנָםיי. אֲבָל מִי שִׁנְשׁוּיִם הִיכִּפּוּרִים לְכַפֵּר וְלֹא מִי שְׁיֵשׁ חִילּוּל הַשֵּׁם בְּיָדוֹ — אֵין לוֹ כֹּחַ בִּתְשׁוּבָה לְתְלוֹת וְלֹא בְּיוֹם הַכִּפּוּרִים לְכַפֵּר וְלֹא בְּיוֹם הַכָּפּוּרִים לְכַפֵּר וְלֹא בְּיוֹם הַכָּפּוּרִים לְכַפֵּר וְלֹא בְּיִשׁר: יִיוְנִגְלָה בְּאָזְנִי ה׳ צְבָאוֹת אִם לְּיבֹר הָעָוֹן הַזֶּה לָכֶם עַד תְּמוֹתוּןן.

- 3. A. In Rome R. Matia b. Harash asked R. Eleazar b. Azariah, ""Have you heard about the four types of atonement that R. Ishmael expounded?"
- B. He said to him, "I heard indeed, but they are three, but with each of them repentance is required.
- C. "One verse of Scripture says, 'Return, you backsliding children, says the Lord, I will heal your backsliding' (Jer. 3:22). A second says,' For on this day shall atonement be made for you to cleanse you' (Lev. 16:30). And a third says, 'Then I will visit their transgression with the rod and their iniquity with strokes' (Ps. 89:33), and a fourth: 'Surely this iniquity shall not be expiated by you until you die' (Is. 22:14).
- D. "How so? If someone has violated a religious duty involving an act of commission but has repented, he does not move from that spot before he is forgiven forthwith. In this regard it is said, 'Return, you backsliding children, says the Lord, I will heal your backsliding' (Jer. 3:22).
- E. "If someone has transgressed a negative commandment but has repented, repentance suspends the punishment and the Day of Atonement atones. In this regard it is said, 'For on this day shall atonement be made for you to cleanse you' (Lev. 16:30).
- E. "If someone has transgressed a rule, the penalty of which is extirpation or judicially inflicted capital punishment, but has repented, the repentance and the Day of Atonement suspend the matter, and suffering on the other days of the year effect atonement, and in this regard it is said, 'Then I will visit their transgression with the rod and their iniquity with strokes' (Ps. 89:33).
- F. "But one who has profaned the name of heaven repentance has not got the power to effect suspension of the punishment, nor suffering to wipe it out, nor the Day of Atonement to atone, but repentance and suffering suspend the punishment, and death will wipe out the sin with them, and in this regard it is said, 'Surely this iniquity shall not be expiated by you until you die' (Is. 22:14)"